Health Impact Assessment Workshop

San Diego, CA • February 22-24, 2011
Introductions

• Megan Wier – San Francisco Dept. of Public Health
• Kim Gilhuly – Human Impact Partners
• Sean Co – Metropolitan Transportation Commission
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3:45</td>
<td>Introduction to HIA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00</td>
<td>Case study 1: San Francisco Road Pricing HIA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:25</td>
<td>Case study 2: Bay Area Metropolitan Transportation Commission – Developing an Active Transportation Performance Target</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:50</td>
<td>How to use results to impact policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5:00</td>
<td>Screening Exercise</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction to
Health Impact Assessment

Health is a state of complete physical, mental and social well-being and not merely the absence of disease or infirmity.
Factors Responsible for Population Health

Health status is determined by: genetics (5%), health care (10%), behavior (30%), Social Conditions (55%) *

*WHO Commission on the Social Determinants of Health (2008)
Incorporating Health into Decision-Making

The world would look different

- Development
- Farm Policy
- Incarceration
- Immigration
- Ports
- Education

[Images of various contexts related to the topics mentioned.]
Why Health?

Augmenting current decision-making processes

Externalities

Disparities

A health frame can be persuasive

People understand health personally

Health is an indicator of quality of life and well-being

Health is a shared value

People are morally outraged by health inequities
Health Impact Assessment

A combination of procedures, methods and tools that systematically judges the potential, and sometimes unintended, effects of a policy, plan, program or project on the health of a population and the distribution of those effects within the population. HIA identifies appropriate actions to manage those effects.

International Association for Impact Assessment, 2006
How does the proposed project, plan, policy affect and lead to health outcomes?
HIA Purpose

Through HIA reports and communications
Judge health effects of a proposed project, plan or policy
Highlight health disparities
Provide recommendations
Shape public decisions & discourse
Make health impacts more explicit

Through the HIA process
Engage & empower community
Emphasize everyday experience
Build consensus
Build relationships & collaborations
# A Brief History of HIA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) requires study of environmental &amp; health effects (however, health impacts have not been adequately addressed in EIA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980s</td>
<td>WHO encourages Health Promotion/Healthy Public Policy in 1986 Ottawa Charter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990s</td>
<td>England, Acheson Report recommends analysis of impacts of policy on health inequities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WHO publishes <em>Gothenburg Consensus Paper on HIA</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First HIA in US (SFDPH, Living Wage)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000s</td>
<td>World Bank requires HIA of all large projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HIA on proposed Alaska North Slope Oil Lease (first integrated HIA into federal EIA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Large industry increasingly adopts internal standards for HIA as good business practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010s</td>
<td>HIA used around the world and, recently, across the U.S.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>North American HIA Practice Standards Released</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HIA continues to gain momentum
119 HIAs Completed or In Progress

Map Courtesy of A. Dannenberg, A. Wendel, CDC NCEH
Why engage others in the HIA process?
Broad range of people affected
Data, information, resources
Relationship building
Capacity for advocacy
Empowerment

Who has engaged?
Community organizations
Advocacy groups
Research groups
Academics
Public health agencies
Planning, regulatory, and other agencies
Elected officials
Private industry and developers
# Roles in HIA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Screening</th>
<th>Identify and prioritize topics for HIAs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scoping</td>
<td>Identify health issues to be studied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prioritize research questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment</td>
<td>Conduct literature reviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Research existing conditions data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conduct surveys, interviews, focus groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conduct data analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interpret and ground truth data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>Identify and prioritize recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reporting</td>
<td>Write, review and edit final report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Develop a communication, media and advocacy plan to report findings to decision-makers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring</td>
<td>Collect data on impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hold decision-makers accountable for decision agreements and mitigations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Addressing HIA “Sticking Points”

What do the critics say about HIA?

What are some of the barriers and solutions to implementing a HIA practice?

How do HIA and advocacy fit together?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criticism</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HIA is costly</td>
<td>Not as costly as treatment of health impacts in the long run</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIA is time-consuming and will slow decision-making processes</td>
<td>Conducting the HIA early will bring issues to the front of the decision-making process, potentially speeding approval processes and preventing costly litigation that delays projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIA will stop economic development</td>
<td>The role of HIA is to identify mitigations and recommendations, not to say “don’t do that”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIA is not scientific</td>
<td>Role of HIA is to pull together disparate pieces of evidence to make a broad statement about impacts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Barriers and Solutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barrier</th>
<th>Example solution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No funding for HIA</td>
<td>Use funding sources creatively</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Need a champion decision-maker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Need examples from other places</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Need successful case study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Supervisors will be upset by public health department’s HIA work</td>
<td>Role of public health agency is to protect the public health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Staff do not have to take an advocacy position, but can weigh in with evidence and data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Certain issues are not thought of as “advocacy” (e.g., tobacco and breastfeeding)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is not enough evidence to demonstrate health impacts</td>
<td>Disparate, single-issue focused evidence exists in public health literature, especially built environment-related</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Role of HIA is pull this together and make a holistic statement about health and health inequities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
HIA and Advocacy/ Opportunities for Collaboration

There are different roles in HIA and not all partners must do all aspects of the HIA.

Transit-Oriented Development HIA

Community group: Held meeting with public agencies and city and provided community education; Advocated passage of recommendations using HIA findings

Health Department: Testified about health impacts

HIP: Presented to community about HIA

Redevelopment HIA

Community group: Wrote and distributed press release organized residents to come to city council meetings

Health Department: Wrote letter to City Council about health impacts

HIP: Held meetings with redevelopment and advocated for health analysis in EIS
Case Studies
Voluntary

Initiated by public health practitioner, policy advocate, affected stakeholders, responsible public agency, or policy-maker

Regulatory

Required by project specific legislation, to comply with Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) requirements, or other HIA regulation

The National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) is the only regulatory requirement for conducting health analyses in public decisions. Historically, EIAs have not done this well.

HIA is used to influence decision-making processes within or outside of the EIA process.
Intervention points

• **Within policy processes**
  – When drafting policies
  – During committee hearings/votes
  – During main votes

• **Within Environmental Impact Reports or Statements**
  – Ask for health or an HIA to be part of the EIR/EIS (included in RFP)
  – When EIR/EIS public scoping is taking place
  – During public comment on Draft EIR/EIS
HIA Reporting Formats

Letters to proponents & decision-makers

Comment letters on draft EIAs

Formal report

Presentations

Peer-reviewed publications
Examples of use and outcomes of HIAs

• Examples:
  – Pittsburg CA TOD HIA
  – Trinity Plaza HIA
  – Paid Sick Days HIA
The HIA Process

Screening

Scoping

Assessment

Recommendations

Reporting

Monitoring
Step 1: Screening

Objective
To decide whether a HIA is feasible, timely, and would add value to the decision-making process.

HIA is used to assess a defined project, plan, or policy

- Have sufficient info about decision
- Understand timing
- Evaluate decision openness
- Assess feasibility
- Be inclusive
- Avoid redundancy
When is a HIA carried out?

The purpose of HIA is to inform decision-makers before they make decisions.

A HIA is most often carried out prospectively - before the decision is made or the policy is implemented.

HIA is used to assess a defined project, plan or policy.
Why NOT do a HIA? Example 1

A plan to improve walkability in Chula Vista, CA

Plan was already considering health
Little opportunity to develop useful recommendations
Health advocates involved in design
Resources better focused elsewhere
Proposed WalMart distribution center, Merced, CA

Idea for the HIA came just before final EIA was released

Elected officials not open to considering health

Health advocates recommendations were being ignored

Resources better used to explore legal options and support the election of more health focused officials
## HIA Screening Worksheet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Screening Questions</th>
<th>Response and Supporting Facts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Has the policy been proposed, or is it likely to be proposed in the next two years? Has a final decision about whether to adopt the proposal not been made and is there sufficient time to conduct an analysis before the decision is made?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Does the decision have the potential to affect, positively or negatively, environmental or social determinants of health that impact health outcomes of a population? Would those health impacts be considered without an HIA?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Are decision-makers and/or those stakeholders who have the capacity to influence decision-makers likely to use HIA findings and recommendations to inform or influence the decision? Is the debate around the policy highly polarized?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Could the proposal being considered potentially impact health inequities? Would one scenario affect vulnerable populations more than another?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Do evidence, expertise, data and research methods exist to analyze health impacts associated with the policy decision?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Are the proposal’s impacts on health outcomes potentially significant in terms of the number of people impacted, the magnitude of impacts, and the breadth and immediacy of impacts?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Are the connections between the proposal and health outcomes neither too obvious nor too indirect?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. If applied, would HIA findings and recommendations potentially improve the impact that the policy has on health?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Would the information produced in the HIA of the policy be applied to future policy development in the same area? Would the HIA serve as an appropriate model for improving the health outcomes related to budget policies?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. What are some barriers to timely completion of the HIA on the policy that you might anticipate?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
HIA Learning Resources

• HIA trainings
  – **SFDPH**: July 24-28, 2011 in Oakland, CA
    – [http://www.sfphes.org/HIA_Training.htm](http://www.sfphes.org/HIA_Training.htm)
    – Contact: [hiacourse.dph@sfdph.org](mailto:hiacourse.dph@sfdph.org) or call 415-252-3919
  – **HIP Action Trainings** – 2 day HIA trainings at your site; contact HIP at 510-452-9442 ext. 102.
  – **On-line resources** – see final slide

• HIA Screening resources
  – Screening White Paper
  – Screening Worksheet

• 2 page summaries of steps of HIA: [http://www.humanimpact.org/capacity-building](http://www.humanimpact.org/capacity-building)
http://www.humanimpact.org/component/jdownloads/finish/11/81

Human Impact Partners HIA resources
http://www.humanimpact.org/hips-hia-tools-and-resources

San Francisco Department of Public Health
www.sfphes.org

Wisconsin DHS HIA Toolkit
http://www.dhs.wisconsin.gov/hia/survey/index.htm

Health Impact Project (Pew & RWJF)
www.healthimpactproject.org

UCLA HIA Clearinghouse
http://www.hiaguide.org